



**GROSSMONT COLLEGE**  
**College Council**  
**Thursday, April 23, 2020**  
**3:00 – 5:00 p.m.**  
**Zoom Meeting**  
**MEETING SUMMARY**

**Purpose:** The College Council is the apex governance body which provides guidance and recommendations to the College President regarding institutional policies, planning, and processes in support of the college mission. It engages all college constituency groups (students, faculty, classified professionals and supervisors/administrators) and the governance system as a whole through the maintenance of clear governance practices and policies, coordination of committee work across functions, and a commitment to continuous improvement and consensus building. The constituent-based representatives of the council serve the college by maintaining a broad, college-wide, and student-centered view of the needs of the institution – both in the weighing of the input from its committees and in bringing forward items for consideration and discussion. In all matters within its purview, it will maintain a focus on the goal of equitable outcomes for all students as a key value informing decision making.

CONVENOR	ASSOCIATED STUDENTS OF GROSSMONT COLLEGE (ASGC)	ADVISORY
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Mike Reese</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <del>Leobardo Rubio</del> (Proxy: Zheming Tang)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Bill McGreevy</i>
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Kaelin Mastronardi	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Judd Curran</i>
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Blanca Valdez	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Patty Sparks</i>
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Enya Castañeda	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Barbara Gallego</i>
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Aaron Starck</i>

ACADEMIC SENATE	CLASSIFIED SENATE	ADMINISTRATORS' ASSOCIATION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Joel Castellaw	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Nadia Almaguer	<input type="checkbox"/> Javier Ayala
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Denise Schulmeyer	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Cindy Emerson	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Martha Clavelle
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Julio Soto	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Michele Martens	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Lida Rafia
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Richard Unis	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <del>Colleen Parsons</del> (Proxy: Bryan Lam)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Michael Copenhaver

RECORDER	GUESTS	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Krista Ames-Cook</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Nabil Abu-Ghazaleh</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Marion de Koning</i>
<i>*Italicized = Non-voting Member</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Pat Murray</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Eric Klein</i>
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Ryan Cline</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Loren Holmquist</i>
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Brodney Fitzgerald</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Keith Turner</i>
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Niko Crumpton</i>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <i>Malia Molina</i>

ROUTINE BUSINESS	
1. Welcome	The meeting began at 3:02 PM by Mike Reese.

2. Establish Virtual Norms	Virtual Norms were discussed and suggested. (1) Record meetings for note taker. (2) Consensus / voting: (a) state item for vote in the chat, (b) record votes in chat grouped by constituencies. (3) Speaking will use the hand raise feature in the participant window. (4) Mute microphone when you're not speaking. (5) Consider ways for guests to observe and keep the chat area reserved for voting and advisory members.
3. Establish Quorum (50% + 1)	Quorum was established with 15 of 16 voting members in attendance.
4. Additions/Deletions to Agenda	None
5. Approve Meeting Notes	<a href="#">Meeting on February 27, 2020</a> - Approved as presented. Voting members approved with a vote via chat window organized by constituency group as mentioned above in the establishing virtual norms section.
6. Public Comment	None

7. President's Report

Nabil addressed the group. Thanked everyone for their continued efforts to make the College Council an effective body at a time when everyone is feeling the pressures. Nabil reported on a few things to establish a consistency in the information that is being distributed. Obviously, we are off campus and have been for over a month now – trying to create some environment that creates continuity of operations and instruction in our services to students and our availability to the community, and it's wearing on us in many ways. It's important to acknowledge that and for everybody to really try to find ways to take care of themselves. It is very important to do that and we each find our own ways of doing this.

It's hard to start a conversation by saying that we have budget problems. But it does create an organizing principle when we say that some of the things we do, or things we are going to have to do, are not the ideals for what our educational institution is focusing on and has been focusing on for the last few years. We've built some very careful processes and reorganized our thinking around student equity. But that we have a very uncertain budget in an environment that is not very clear. The answer is if I give you a firm answer today, it will most likely change. Regardless, there are some things that are clear. Before COVID-19 hit, we were looking down the barrel of a very difficult budget year because of state revenues and a decline in our enrollments. That is going to be made even worse, and we don't know how much worse, by the economic impact of delays in tax revenue caused by the delays in tax reporting. When we look at what the budget will require us to do, we are going to need to plan for some very drastic changes in how we are spending our resources. And he says this very clearly so that regardless of what the impact is, we do our best to protect the core of the organization. The core of the organization is the people of the organization – our staff, meaning our employees. Essentially the full-time staff, the full-time faculty, and the administration where the culture and institutional memory resides. It's very important to do what we can to protect that.

So what do we have to do? We're going to have to reduce our spending, in this current year, as much as we can so that we cover what will emerge soon as the deficit for this year. The state is going to short us an unknown amount of money. We're going to need to do whatever we can to have an ending balance – would like to say a healthy ending balance – at the end of next year so that we can resume what we're doing without too many difficulties.

It's uncomfortable to talk about the budget except that it does drive a lot of the things that we have to talk about. One of the things we're starting with is summer school – the size of the schedule and delaying the start. As a college, we have shifted the summer school program that it starts June 22<sup>nd</sup> and it'll give students a longer opportunity to prepare for summer school, but we have also dramatically reduced our schedule. We've reduced it to 25% of what it was last year (approx. 70 sections). While that's a very small number, all of the sections will be offered via distance education. The goal here is to protect the primary terms – fall and spring – and make sure that what we can afford the classes that will be offered and delay some of our offerings until we have a chance to be back on campus. So the offerings can be more balanced with traditional lecture, distance education lecture, and (where we can) lab classes.

Another thing that we're going to have to do unfortunately is reduce our hourly work. When we first went out of campus, the district-wide messaging was that all hourly employees would continue being paid for their regular assignments. This emergency has dragged on quite long, much longer than anybody perceived at the start. We're in the process of searching for those assignments where people are continuing to be paid even though it's not possible for them to actually do

anything or effective work. That will be the primary area where we will reduce hourly pay. Federal Financial Aid and some CalWorks and EOPS payments will continue because they are a form of financial aid. There will be a lot of hiring hold backs where we have vacancies that we have been recruiting – not a hard freeze and we will be very judicious as to if and when we fill vacant positions. Nabil is taking personal responsibility with when positions will be released to be filled. We do not want to hire on one end and then feel insecure with our budget on the other end down the line. We want to make sure that when we hire and fill positions, it's for critical work that nobody can do and that it does not interfere with our ability to maintain the existing core employees. We will reduce our subs and out-of-class positions as appropriate. It's not necessary to pay people for substitute positions who are not currently working because they require access to campus, so this is another place where we are saving some of our expenditures.

District Executive Council (DEC) has essentially recast itself from a consultative body with the various units to a district-wide emergency response group. It used to meet once a month, and is now meeting once a week. Five Rapid Response Planning Teams have been formed. These teams will be looking across the district at Facilities, Technology, Student Services, Instructional Delivery, and Human Resources. These are Rapid Response Teams that will look into what we need to do while we are out and, more importantly, how we prepare for returning to campus when that becomes a possibility. Again there is no certainty in California as to when we can begin to phase in, but it's been described as a dimmer and not an on/off switch. As we phase in our return to campus, these five areas become areas on how we load in and how we load out. In a recent message, he shared that while we are planning on how to return, we are also preparing how to leave campus again should circumstances require it. We may bump into ourselves coming as we are going. We have to plan for all eventualities. We have to plan as a district and as a college. As programs and departments we have to plan for the eventuality of returning and the eventuality of having to leave yet again if there are flare ups in COVID-19, which is a distinct possibility. The first time we were caught unawares, and that's fine, but if that happens again this is seriously problematic.

One of the areas that we need to keep in mind is we are still a college and in service to our community and we need to cast ourselves as the less expensive alternative that's closer to home. Our marketing approach as a college needs to be essentially – “We're here for you. We've always been here for you, but we're really here for you now.” We're seeing a trend of people not wanting to travel to return to universities where they will take their classes. And so that marketing will be intermeshed with the district and state enrollment strategy marketing campaign. We need to be sensitive to local industry and make sure that adult workers also have access to career training in those industries that are still very active such as health care.

We need to maintain our accessibility to the community in the form of virtual events. Nabil is bringing this to us as a way to insert an opportunity and invitation for people to participate in the College Forum that is next week on Thursday (April 30<sup>th</sup>). There will be a Student Forum earlier in the day as well. These have been advertised already and registration is required. There are 200+ people who are registered for the College Forum and we are encouraged to participate. Our Outreach Team is also very active in continuing to do high school outreach. There are two Super Saturdays, virtual of course, coming up in May. Student Services has been holding a series of day and evening Student Success Fairs to connect students with the services on campus. It's like holding an office hour for students with all services represented and all the services are answering questions for any

students who show up. These are complementary services to what we would normally do on campus. Not to mention, of course, the incredible transition that our instructional programs have made going from the typical/traditional campus to the online instruction. But all of this is coming about not just because of the decline in our access to campus and decline in the budget, but because of turbulence. Turbulence means things like our international students program that took a huge hit. We've been quite dependent on international student revenues, in the form of 5% of our budget. A 5% to 10% budget cut from state revenues is likely. Enrollment declines are a possibility, which could affect us. We need to be patient with each other, to ask questions, and to question ideas and decisions, but to keep engaging in them in a manner that can get us to a place where we can continue as an organization that has prided itself for a long time in being a place of excellence. And that our excellence now looks like being collaborative and being collegial. In a new format being patient with each other and helping everybody. Grossmont College is place of excellence in east San Diego County.

Nabil stopped there and opened it up for questions.

Comment from Mike C. (in chat) – Disagrees with hourly reductions in the middle of this crisis without further discussion and input from the constituency groups. Nabil responded that the request to reduce hourly pay is in the areas where workers are not able to do work from home. Contractual work (i.e., TAs) will continue. Financial Aid related work (Federal W-S, CalWorks, and EOPS) will continue. Where we are paying people and we're not getting any work because our working conditions have changed, is where we need to evaluate. We need to be able to pay our salaries and benefits. Things could be so bad that we cannot pay our basic bills and this is the level of urgency that we are trying to contend with. We are looking at the possibility of being asked to cut 15% of our budget, and yet if 90%+ of the budget is salaries/benefits, then where is the 15% coming from? If we overreact (with our budget cuts) then we can readdress at a later date.

Follow up comment from Mike C. (in chat) – Even though he sits on DEC as a representative for Administrators Association and had heard about reducing hourly pay, he does not recall the level of detail that is now being asked of managers with cutting hourly workers. Nabil commented that he hears the fears people have, but some of these decisions are something that has been needed for a long time. He no longer has a directive to pay the hourly employees even if they are not doing work. For example, we are paying lifeguards 25 hours a week, even though our pool is closed. Nabil is not sure it's wise to continue to pay for this position when he's looking for how to cut 15% in the overall budget. This is pretty urgent and if we talk about this for another month. He's happy to pay people for their work, if they are working for the organization. He has not yet cut anyone's pay. It may turn out that it's only a few people and there's not much to cut, or it could be several hundred thousands of dollars each month that going forward could be spent elsewhere.

Follow up questions/comments (in chat) related to budget and hourly pay. Nabil's response: It's going to be entirely up to the Chancellor how she directs her Presidents to run their colleges. We have the authority to set the expenditures from our budgets. It's important to say that while nobody likes to make the decisions that have to be made, it's easy for people to complain when they are not made. Make a decision. Tell us what it is. Be clear. The expenditure of college resources is decidedly a matter for the president. We don't run the college by committee. But if DEC prevails on the Chancellor and the Chancellor directs the Presidents to do something else, so be it.

Right now Nabil is looking at a budget projection that does not suggest that we can afford to continue to expend resources for which we are not getting service. We cannot support paying out resources for people who are not actively working from home (i.e. hourly workers). Nabil has to be able to have the authority to say where expenditures are legally appropriate, where it's contractually appropriate, where we're not getting actual value for our resources so we can pay our bills and our staffing. Nabil doesn't expect this to be an easy conversation, but this is not an easy time.

Even before COVID-19, there was a lot of uncertainty. Nabil doesn't know what next year's budget will look like, and he doesn't even know what this year's budget looks like in a literal sense because the state is looking to short our budget. A couple of months ago, we were facing budget shortfalls of \$4.3 or \$4.4 million (at the district), which Grossmont is about 55% of this and equals about \$2 million dollars short for this year that we don't have. Next year's budget is unknown. Right now they are going to budget us for 5% less, but they're asking us to hold off on another 5%, and our international students' revenue will be hit dramatically. Only 10% of our budget does not go to salaries and benefits so Nabil is feeling a little nervous about our budget. It is from this perspective that he is saying as college president, he is responsible for making sure we do whatever we can to budget our year (this year) to have some ending balance to start next year with, and to plan for a much smaller college next year – both in terms of our offerings and in terms of our expenditures. It's difficult to say how many of our hourly workers are doing work that is critical or not doing work at all. He's seeking this information now – if he gets good information, then he can make good decisions. If he gets bad information, then we won't be able to make good decisions. He's hoping that he gets good information from everyone on the front lines who is supervising the work of our hourly employees.

Request from Lida (in chat) about the guiding principles for cutting hours for hourly workers. This should be clear so that we can give the President the best information to determine the outcome. From Nabil, start with who is actually working and submitting time sheets; where do we have hourly workers and others who are paid on an hourly basis that are submitting time sheets and are possibly not working for the college?

Comment from Joel: Thanked Nabil for being here to respond and provide updates to us. Our job as College Council is to provide guidance and recommendations to the President from our participatory governance committees and if the President has specifically requested us to do so.

Nabil acknowledged that this is painful work to do. As he's thinking of hourly workers, he has specific people in mind that he knows are going to be impacted. Yes, Joel is correct that College Council is a place of guidance and recommendation. However, Nabil appreciates the opportunity to have a forum where he can share, defend his thinking, and get feedback from people. By design, he does not have a seat at any of the participatory governance meetings. And yet these are urgent times where he needs a place or a forum where he can talk with people. We're making decisions as a college, and in various places as a district that in our private moments will draw tears. But it is ultimately about seeing a very threatening and heavy toll on an institution's capacity to do its core work.

Nabil has been asked to cut sections in our instructional program. Our enrollments were already struggling. We've got to, as a college, get to a place where we can at least maintain that instructional core and service programs so

	<p>we can stay relevant and strong. Nabil would love nothing more to be able to come back and say nothing we feared about the budget has come to light and we can now resume.</p> <p>Comment/Question from Barbara: We don't have the technology for the students to do some of the work – it's not that we don't have work for them to do...need computers for the students and a reliable phone technology system for them to call people. The amount of work we'll have is not manageable (for classified). During a recession, tends to double and triple for those that are still there. Hopes that these cuts are temporary. Eventually we're going to need these hourly employees.</p> <p>From Nabil: During an economic downturn, that's the hard part of having to manage when you're being presented with impossible conditions. It's not a mathematical equation to which there is a correct answer. It's a difficult circumstance where we have to come up with the best possible solution. Nabil feels for the managers. How do we maintain the integrity of this operation when we do not know when we will have adequate staffing?</p> <p>Nabil acknowledges that this/these potential budget cut/s is/are not fair. There is no one right answer, however there are degrees of wrong answers. For now we are being asked to look at who is not working. Look at where we have some flexibility for cuts. Start with those who are not working. No permanent decisions are being made. All decisions are ones that can/will be reversed as soon as situation changes/improves.</p> <p>In a recession, students tend to come flooding in. This is unlike anything we've ever experienced before. We don't have the experience, or the wisdom, and it's not part of a cyclical downturn. This is something different. We don't know – it could be more extreme good or bad. Be prepared for any eventual outcome.</p>
--	--

DISCUSSION OF PRIOR AGENDA ITEMS / OLD BUSINESS	

NEW BUSINESS	

FOR CONSENSUS *	
<small>* On College Council, consensus is reached when at least three-fourths (75%) of voting members present are in agreement on a decision. Consensus is <u>not</u> reached on College Council if more than two (2) of those in the minority are members of the same constituency (Gov. Handbook, pg. 10).</small>	
1. <b>Strategic Hires</b>	None

INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION	

REPORTS	
1. <b>Accreditation Steering Committee</b> (Catherine)	See attached <b>Progress Report: April 2020 "Accreditation Follow-Up Response"</b>
2. <b>Budget Committee</b> (BC)	No report
3. <b>Facilities Committee</b> (FC)	No report
4. <b>Planning and Institutional Effectiveness Committee</b> (PIEC)	No report
5. <b>Professional Development Committee</b> (PDC)	No report
6. <b>Staffing Committee</b> (SC)	<p>Mike shared that Nabil provided an update. Available in the meeting summary on the website. Nabil added that he updated the Staffing Committee about the list of positions that are on hold at this time. The few positions that are going forward were outlined and explained.</p> <p>Mike added that we are trying finalize the Communication position that was held over from last year. From the Board Docket (this week), the Psychology position is not moving forward at this time.</p> <p>Nabil added that he is keeping his options open for hiring. He will rely on the Staffing Committee's recommendations and their prioritization lists when conditions improve.</p>
7. <b>Classified Staffing Prioritization Committee</b> (CSPC)	Aaron reported that the CSPC is looking for a time to meet via Zoom. Will review past practices and which rubric will be used.
8. <b>Faculty Staffing Prioritization Committee</b> (FSPC)	No report per Brodney.
9. <b>Student Success &amp; Equity Committee</b> (SSEC)	No report
10. <b>Technology Committee</b> (TC) (Eric Klein)	No report

FOLLOW-UP		
Who	Item	Timeline

<p>11. <b>WORK AHEAD</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Date for Committee Chairs and College Council to meet</i></li> <li>• <i>Date for College Council Retreat</i></li> </ul>
--

<p><b>NEXT MEETING: Thursday, May 21, 2020 (1:00 to 3:00 PM via Zoom)</b>  <i>* Note different time and on 3<sup>rd</sup> Thursday due to Final Exams during 4<sup>th</sup> Thursday.</i></p>
---

**Question from the floor:**

Blanca (ASGC) asked about the end of semester date – is it being extended this term. Some students are brand new to using the computers and submitting the work in this way.

Judd stated that he has heard this concern from some of his students and would like to know if the incomplete option is possible for some students.

Aaron added that extending the semester is decided at the Chancellor's Cabinet level. Extending the class time can be done (i.e., pursuing incompletes) at the faculty level – even if it's during her last/final semester. Work it out with each class and communicate this with A&R so it can be updated properly on transcripts.

Nabil addressed Blanca (and all the students) – A lot of people are here for you...some changes affect all students and some affect only some. Some of these decisions are less than ideal for individual students even though it may be better for collective group.

**ADJOURN** – Meeting ended at 4:26 PM

### ***Committees are to establish norms***

In order to create valued outcomes, a commitment to participation, dialogue, and the pursuit of value in the form of useful output by all is necessary. It is acknowledged that there are power dynamics in a room. Work must be done to create the equitable and inclusive environment sought for effective and active participation. To do so, council/committee members will establish behavioral norms that include the following meeting rules of engagement, make use of meeting tools, and respect the roles of each member.

#### ***Rules of Engagement***

In participatory government, a high level of collegiality, respect, and civility is expected. Those expectations include the following rules:

1. Free flow of conversation and raising hands when needed.
2. Thumbs up/Thumbs down/Thumbs sideways to convey individual council members vote toward action items.
3. Parking lot for ideas and possible future action items.
4. Summarize talking points with similar language for constituency representatives to take back to their respected constituency, and taking the last 5 minutes of the meeting to do this.
5. Estimated times for each agenda item is up to the Convenor of the council.
6. No rank in the room, but those that wish can use salutations.
7. Please keep dialogue respectful.
8. Reminder – body language.
9. Once a semester have a social gathering.
10. Starting and Ending the meeting on time.
11. Respect each other.
12. Repeating what was voted on after the vote.
13. Education/background from other committees to make appropriate decisions.
14. Use of technology/cell phones is only in an emergency, and to be mindful and professional of the meeting.
15. Norms will be revisited once a semester for now.